

16 September 2010

REFERRAL RESPONSE - HERITAGE

FILE NO: DA 283/2010/1

ADDRESS: 37 Darling Point Road DARLING POINT 2027

PROPOSAL: Demolition of existing buildings & removal of selected trees

FROM: Sara Reilly - Heritage Officer

TO: Mrs L Holbert

Application documents

The following documentation provided by the applicant has been examined for this referral response:

- Drawing set by Tanner Architects, dated May 2010 and numbered:
AR.DA.00/A – Cover Sheet and Location Plan
AR.DA.01/A - Existing Site Plan
AR.DA.02/A - Demolition Site Plan
AR.DA.03/A – Site Analysis
- Statement of Heritage Impact by Tanner Architects, dated June 2010
- Statement of Environmental Effects by Tanner Architects, dated June 2010

Research

The following research was undertaken in the preparation of this assessment:

- The site was inspected on the 1 July 2010. The interior was inspected.
- A comparative analysis was undertaken to compare the work of Maurice B. Halligan in the Woollahra Municipality. The following buildings were visited and externally inspected:
 - a. The Royal Sydney Golf Club, Kent Road, Rose Bay
 - b. 1 St Mark's Road, Darling Point 'Yeomerry'
 - c. 3 Victoria Road, Bellevue Hill 'Wirian'
 - d. 4 Victoria Road, Bellevue Hill 'Buyuma'
 - e. 22 Fairfax Road, Bellevue Hill 'St Kieran's / Chislehurst'
 - f. 32 Victoria Road, Bellevue Hill 'Meriden'
 - g. 28-30 Fairfax Road, Bellevue Hill, site of former house designed by, and residence of Halligan 'Winburn'

Review of documents and photographic evidence:

- Review of Council's property system to establish dates of earlier building and development applications.
- Review of previous heritage referral response by Council's former Heritage Officer Louise Thom, dated 29 March 2010.
- Review of letter to Council from Ian Stapleton of Clive Lucas Stapleton and Partners Pty Ltd regarding Halligan and *St Kieran's*, 22 Fairfax Road, Bellevue Hill.

- Review of Council's photography files relevant to immediate area
- Review of Council's inventory sheets
- Review of Council's aerial photography and mapping database
- Review Google Maps – street view

Statutory and policy documents

The following statutory and policy documents are relevant to the application:

- Woollahra LEP 1995
- Woollahra Residential DCP 2003
- Heritage Act 1977 – Section 170

Heritage status

- The subject building is not a heritage item, however a Norfolk Island Pine exists on the site which is a heritage item.
- The subject site appears on the Heritage Branch inventory as a listed item under authority of the State Government, listed as the Sydney Dialysis Centre, under the Heritage Act 1977 – Section 170 Register, Department of Health.
- The subject building is in the vicinity of heritage items at 12 Darling Point Road, '*Wavenal*'; 188 New South Head Road '*Ascham School*' (precinct comprising: *Fiona* and former entrance gates, *Glenrock* and inner and outer gates, the *Dower House*, sandstone works, remaining open space and oval adjacent to *Fiona*, Moreton Bay Figs, *The Octagon*, and *Yeomerry*); 53 Darling Point Road, which is St Mark's Rectory by Edmund Blacket.
- The subject building is not listed on the State Heritage Register.
- The subject building is not a potential heritage item as per the Woollahra LEP Amendment no. 66 (Heritage Items) nor within the vicinity of a potential heritage item.

Significance of heritage item

This Norfolk Island Pine is a most visually significant specimen, particularly when viewed from the western approach to the Municipality along New South Head Road, Rushcutter's Bay and from the surrounding ridges. Located prominently on the ridge the tree is a landmark planting and particularly important in the context of being a tall, lone remnant of the original estate gardens prior to the ubiquitous high-rise development of Darling Point. The Norfolk Island Pine is an integral component of the early cultural planting of Darling Point, and as such forms part of the larger visual and historic character of this inner city suburb.

Significance of any heritage item in the vicinity

53 Darling Point Road, Rectory of St Mark's: The Church and Rectory buildings represent some of the earliest examples of 'Academic Gothic Revival' style architecture in Sydney. They are outstanding examples of this style, which was promoted by Bishop Broughton and facilitated the extraordinary abilities of Edmund Thomas Blacket, who was to become Australia's leading exponent of ecclesiastical design. Though one of the earliest major works of Blacket, the Church remains one of his best known and successful designs.

St Mark's Church and Rectory are given added prominence by their siting and their elevated position. The tower and spire of the Church have always been a dominant landmark on the Darling Point ridge since their construction and retain a visual prominence from many vantage points, despite the surrounding modern high-rise development. The quality of the materials and workmanship as well as

the patina of age and use that has mellowed the fabric of the Church and Rectory combined with the character of the surviving sandstone and iron fencing details has produced an outstanding streetscape of the early Victoria era, which despite the loss of some interesting buildings retains much of the Romantic English Village character depicted in several early drawings and water colours of Darling Point Road.

Ascham School: An historically and architecturally important group of early Victorian residences being built on the original 'Glenrock Estate' whose relationship and landscaped environment contribute much to the Edgecliff area.

Fiona: A substantial mid-Victorian mansion built in 1864 and designed by John F. Hilly. Former residence of Sir Edward Knox, an important merchant. Built of smooth sandstone with articulated quoins. A restrained exercise in Classical design. The façade displays a rhythm of arched windows and arched entrance porticos. The main entrance and gates remain intact. The sandstone porte cochere was added in the late 19th century.

Glenrock: A good example of a large Italianate mansion built c.1870 surviving in good condition which survives as a valuable link with early Glenrock Estate.

The Dower House: Was built c1842 by Mr Whistler Smith for his mother, and sold to the Knox family after 1859 as an addition to the Fiona estate. The Dower House is a charming Victorian Gothic two storey house of sandstone with picturesque dormer windows, steeply pitched tile roof and tudor chimneys. An important early home of the Darling Point area which forms a visually attractive element in the Ascham School grounds.

The Octagon: Octagonal shaped building of two stories constructed of brick (currently cement rendered) on stone foundations with wooden roof tiled (possibly later addition). Plaster walls and ceilings, internal joinery of cedar. Probably the only building designed by Ambrose Hallen when he was Colonial Architect which has survived. Also it is the first building erected on Darling Point.

Yeomerry: discussed later in comparative analysis

Significance of subject site

The Heritage Council has developed a set of seven criteria for assessing heritage significance, which can be used to make decisions about the heritage value of a place or item. There are two levels of heritage significance used in NSW: state and local. The following assessment of heritage significance has been prepared for the entire site in accordance with the 'Assessing Heritage Significance' (2001) guideline from the NSW Heritage Manual.

Historical significance SHR criterion (a)	An item is important in the course, or pattern, of Woollahra's cultural or natural history The building known as <i>Duntrim</i> is significant as the original site of the early Victorian mansion <i>Glanworth</i> built in 1852. <i>Glanworth</i> was one of the original grand residences built on the peninsula of Darling Point and part of the earliest subdivisions. The foundations and basement of this building remain relatively intact and undisturbed. The building known as <i>Duntrim</i> was built in 1911 for William Taylor Macpherson, by the well-known architect Maurice B Halligan. The building was used by Sydney Hospital as a nurses' home from 1954 until 1981, after which it became the State Government's Sydney Dialysis Centre until the present time. It has been a community health facility for over 50 years. <i>Each of the three attributes above, by themselves, is of medium significance at a local level.</i>
---	--

	<u>Guidelines for inclusion</u> - Shows evidence of a significant human activity - Is associated with a significant activity or historical phase - Maintains or shows the continuity of a historical process or activity	<u>Guidelines for exclusion</u> - Has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important activities or processes - Provides evidence of activities or processes that are of dubious historical importance - Has been so altered that it can no longer provide evidence of a particular association
Historical association significance SHR criterion (b)	An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in Woollahra's cultural or natural history. The building known as <i>Duntrim</i> is built on the stone basement and foundations of <i>Glanworth</i>, the early Victorian villa built for Robert Coveny (1809-1878), merchant and philanthropist, who appears in the Australian Dictionary of Biography. <i>Glanworth</i> was later owned by The Honourable James Watson (1837-1907), merchant and politician, who is also listed in the Australian Dictionary of Biography. <i>This attribute by itself is of medium significance at a local level.</i> The place is strongly associated with its architect, Maurice B Halligan (1863-1926), who was an important Australian architect of the late 19th and early 20th century. The building is one of a group of substantial and complex works by Halligan, and forms part of the architect's body of work in the local area. Four other buildings by Halligan out of six or so known are currently listed in the Woollahra LEP. <i>This attribute by itself is of medium significance at a local level.</i>	
	<u>Guidelines for inclusion</u> - Shows evidence of a significant human occupation - Is associated with a significant event, person, or group of persons	<u>Guidelines for exclusion</u> - Has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important people or events - Provides evidence of people or events that are of dubious historical importance - Has been so altered that it can no longer provide evidence of a particular association
Aesthetic significance SHR criterion (c)	An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in Woollahra. Exhibiting substantial scale, landmark location, mature historic garden setting, representative Arts and Crafts features, and fine intact interiors, <i>Duntrim</i> is a substantial representative example of the Arts and Crafts style of Maurice B. Halligan. 1920's additions and more recent alterations are generally either sympathetic or reversible. <i>This attribute by itself is of high significance at a local level.</i>	
	<u>Guidelines for inclusion</u> - Shows or is associated with, creative or technical innovation or achievement - Is the inspiration for a creative or technical	<u>Guidelines for exclusion</u> - Is not a major work by an important designer or artist - Has lost its design or technical integrity

	innovation or achievement • Is aesthetically distinctive • Has landmark qualities • Exemplifies a particular taste, style or technology	• Its positive visual or sensory appeal or landmark and scenic qualities have been more than temporarily degraded • Has only a loose association with a creative or technical achievement
Social significance SHR criterion (d)	An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in Woollahra for social, cultural or spiritual reasons. The place has been a community health facility, the Sydney Hospital and the Sydney Dialysis Centre for 56 years. The building and its grounds are recognised by the local community as a historically significant residence and aesthetic landmark of the Darling Point peninsula <i>These attributes should be considered to be of medium significance at a local level.</i>	
	<u>Guidelines for inclusion</u> • Is important for its association with an identifiable group • Is important to a community's sense of place	<u>Guidelines for exclusion</u> • Is only important to the community for amenity reasons • Is retained only in preference to a proposed alternative
Technical/research significance SHR criterion (e)	An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of Woollahra's cultural or natural history. The place contains the remnants of the former Victorian mansion <i>Glanworth</i>, built in 1852, and also its former grounds and landscaping. <i>This attribute by itself is of low significance at a local level.</i> The building is a resource for the understanding of the architectural detailing of the architect, Maurice B. Halligan. <i>This attribute by itself is of low significance at a local level.</i>	
	<u>Guidelines for inclusion</u> • Has the potential to yield new or further substantial scientific and/or archaeological information • Is an important benchmark or reference site or type • Provides evidence of past human cultures that is unavailable elsewhere	<u>Guidelines for exclusion</u> • The knowledge gained would be irrelevant to research on science, human history or culture • Has little archaeological or research potential • Only contains information that is readily available from other resources or archaeological sites
Rarity SHR criterion (f)	An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of Woollahra's cultural or natural history. The building known as <i>Duntrim</i>, whilst a large and landmark example of its type, is not a rare example of the Arts and Crafts style, which is common throughout the municipality.	

	<u>Guidelines for inclusion</u> - Provides evidence of a defunct custom, way of life or process - Demonstrates a process, custom or other human activity that is in danger of being lost - Shows unusually accurate evidence of a significant human activity - Is the only example of its type - Demonstrates designs or techniques of exceptional interest - Shows rare evidence of a significant human activity important to a community	<u>Guidelines for exclusion</u> Is not rare - Is numerous but under threat
Representative ness SHR criterion (g)	An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of Woollahra's cultural or natural places or cultural or natural environments. As indicated above, the building is a substantial representative example of the Arts and Crafts style, and of the work of Maurice B. Halligan, and remains substantially intact, internally and externally. <i>This attribute by itself is of high significance at a local level.</i>	
	<u>Guidelines for inclusion</u> Is a fine example of its type Has the principal characteristics of an important class or group of items Has attributes typical of a particular way of life, philosophy, custom, significant process, design, technique or activity - Is a significant variation to a class of items Is part of a group which collectively illustrates a representative type Is outstanding because of its setting, condition or size - Is outstanding because of its integrity or the esteem in which it is held	<u>Guidelines for exclusion</u> - Is a poor example of its type - Does not include or has lost the range of characteristics of a type - Does not represent well the characteristics that make up a significant variation of a type

Statement of significance for subject site

The building known as *Duntrim* has significance for it represents and exhibits the aspirations of wealthy land owners of Darling Point in the early twentieth century. It has significance for its ability to reflect the early subdivision pattern and land tenure and use through its association with the former mansion *Glanworth*.

Duntrim was built in approximately 1911, on the foundations of the early Victorian mansion *Glanworth*, built in 1852. The foundations of *Glanworth* remain at the basement level of the existing building. *Glanworth* was built for the merchant and philanthropist Robert Coveny (1809-1878), and was later owned by The Honourable James Watson (1837-1907), merchant and politician.

The building known as *Duntrim* was built for William Taylor Macpherson, by the well-known architect Maurice B. Halligan (1863-1926), who was an important Australian architect of the late 19th and early 20th century. The building is one of a group of substantial and sophisticated works by Halligan, and forms part of the architect's body of work in the local area, most of which is locally listed. Many of

Halligan's other buildings located in the Sydney CBD, the North Shore and regional towns are local or state listed items.

The building was used by Sydney Hospital as a nurses' home from 1954 until 1981, after which it became the State Government's Sydney Dialysis Centre until the present time. It has been a community health facility for over 50 years.

Exhibiting substantial scale, landmark location, mature historic garden setting, representative Arts and Crafts features, and fine intact interiors, *Duntrim* is a substantial representative example of the Arts and Crafts style of Maurice B. Halligan. The 1920's additions and the more recent alterations are generally either sympathetic or reversible.

The building is part of a group of extant substantial landmark mansions and historic buildings which sit atop the crest of the Darling Point peninsula. As a historic group they contribute to a historic precinct which reflects the early subdivisions, grand mansions and historic character of the area.

Comparative analysis

A comparative analysis of Maurice B. Halligan's known work in the local area was carried out by the author of this report.

The Tanner report lists seven buildings it claims to be the work of Halligan in the Woollahra Municipality. Five of these are listed as heritage items in the Woollahra LEP 1995. The addresses for the other two non-listed houses, *Mr H Fairfax House*, Victoria Road, Bellevue Hill, c.1904, and *Maurice Bernard Halligan House*, c.1904 are not identified by address in either the Tanner report or Louise Thom's report.

However, the Tanner report states that "The two dwellings constructed circa 1904, *Mr H Fairfax House* and presumed to have been his own, *Maurice Bernard Halligan House*, both have social significance through their associations with notable individuals of the local area. Neither appears to be listed on the Woollahra LEP, however would be more significant representations of Halligan's work than *Duntrim*."

Louise Thom's report accepts this unsubstantiated claim, above, regarding the two unidentified non-listed houses, when it states that "the other two buildings by Halligan that are not listed in the WLEP are considered by the Tanner report to be also superior to *Duntrim*". She concludes in her recommendations that these two buildings should have their heritage significance assessed.

The Woollahra Local Studies Library has now identified the two other properties: the *Maurice Bernard Halligan House* c.1904 as 'Winburn' 28-30 Fairfax Road, Bellevue Hill, and *Mr H. Fairfax House*, c. 1904 as 32 Victoria Road, Bellevue Hill.

Interestingly, the *Maurice Bernard Halligan House*, identified as 'Winburn', 28-30 Fairfax Road, Bellevue Hill (Mitchell Library reference 'Art & architecture', vol.2, no.1, 1905, p.31) no longer exists, as it was demolished to make way for two residential flat buildings in 1934. The possible original garage to the street from 1922

was retained during construction and used as a site office. The specification for the new flat buildings mentions demolition of the existing residence.

Thus it seems impossible that this house can be more significant a representation of Halligan's work than *Duntrim*, as Tanner's report claims, as it no longer exists.

The other building, *Mr H Fairfax House*, is identified as 'Meriden', 32 Victoria Road, Bellevue Hill (Mitchell library reference 'Art and architecture: the journal of the institute of architects of NSW' vol.2, no.1, 1905, p.32 MDQ720.6/10). This building is a large residential dwelling, but not of the scale or landmark location of *Duntrim*. It also presents as an Arts and Crafts building, with a complex pitched slate roof, rough rendered masonry, face brick chimney and other features typical of Arts and Crafts buildings. The building had substantial alterations and additions approved and constructed in 2007 which have changed the external form by the addition of garage to the south and perhaps other changes to the rear. This building may or may not reach the criteria for listing. It is most likely similar to many other large residential dwellings of some aesthetic and historic significance that currently exist in Victoria Road which are not currently listed. Unlike *Duntrim*, it is not part of a particularly significant precinct, however, it is situated, like *Duntrim*, near historic school buildings. This building is a private residence, and as far as can be ascertained, has always been a private residence. Thus there is no social/community component such as at *Duntrim*.

Halligan's buildings listed in the Woollahra LEP 1995

Of the five buildings noted in the Tanner report as being listed in the Woollahra LEP 1995 by Halligan in the Woollahra Municipality, the Royal Sydney Golf Club is the largest and most aesthetically sophisticated, also with a high degree of social and historic significance. Council's former Heritage Officer has previously recommended it be proposed for listing on the State Heritage Register. Its significance would be unquestionable and beyond the realm of the significance of *Duntrim*. It will not be further discussed here.

Yeomerry c.1913, which is now part of the Ascham School complex, is attributed to Halligan and Wilton, but also to Waterhouse and Lake, thus its designer is unclear. It is also listed on the RAIA's Twentieth Century Buildings of Significance Register, where it is attributed to Halligan. This building is a generous Arts and Crafts building in a well established garden. There are fine Arts and Crafts features such as a generous stone base and arched entry porch, rough-cast render walls, Art Nouveau stained glass windows, diamond-patterned leadlight windows alternating with masonry columns in the front faceted bay, timber shingles at upper level, prominent face brick capped rough-cast rendered chimney, and a pitched and gabled roof. *Yeomerry* is similar in detailing to *Duntrim*, but not of the same scale and landmark location.

Wirian c.1923, was designed by Halligan and Wilton in a restrained Arts and Crafts style. It does not have the same presence, garden setting or landmark location as *Duntrim*. Its listing attributes historical significance due in part to its association with Halligan, and 'its comparative rarity as an intact example of the body of residential works of the architectural firm of Halligan and Wilton'. Thus it could be argued that *Duntrim* is also rare.

The listing states that 'The firm of Halligan and Wilton was established in 1907. Prior to this time Maurice Halligan ran a flourishing practice as a sole practitioner. He was responsible for the design of the Royal Sydney Golf Club, Tooths Maltery House in Mittagong, multi-storey commercial buildings in the city and a number of private residences. Halligan ceased to practice in 1921 at the age of 68'. (listing by Noel Bell Ridley Smith and Partners)

Buyuma c.1904 is attributed to Halligan by the Tanner report, but the inventory listing sheet does not specify the designer. The letter from Ian Stapleton also attributes this building to Halligan. This building is aesthetically unusual with a prominent cylindrical facade form with a cone-shaped shingle roof. It sits in a prominent location at the corner of Victoria Road and New South Head Road. (This view has been partly obscured by new development). It is an accomplished Arts and Crafts building, appearing to remain relatively intact. The building does not have the scale, garden setting or landmark location of *Duntrim*. Later subdivisions have obscured its setting and visual impact.

Chislehurst/St Kierans c. 1905 is attributed to Halligan on the heritage inventory listing sheet (by Colin Brady Architecture and Planning). It does not have the scale, garden setting or landmark location of *Duntrim*, however, it appears to be a rare example of a unique aesthetic in Australia, the East Coast Shingle style. The building has been subdivided into two apartments, but is documented as remaining intact both internally and externally.

A heritage assessment of *Chislehurst* in 2005 by Clive Lucas Stapleton and Partners lists some of Halligan and Wilton's other works. They are best known for Kingsclere apartment building, Potts Point, 1910, which was the first New York style apartment building constructed in Australia. They also designed 45-63 Macleay Street, Potts Point, which contains the famous Yellow House. Other works by Halligan and Wilton mentioned are: Tooth's Brewery, 1913; British American Tobacco Company building, Kensington, 1913; Royal Sydney Golf Club, 1910 (following a fire in 1920 this was rebuilt to an altered design); Dymocks Building, George Street, c.1925; numerous hotels including the Stanmore Hotel, Newmarket Hotel, Redfern Hotel, and the Observer Hotel.

Halligan was well known for his residential buildings in Bellevue Hill and Woollahra.

Conclusion of comparative analysis

Maurice B. Halligan is an architect of skill and reknown, and designed extensively in Sydney city and the eastern suburbs, particularly in the Woollahra Municipality. A large number of his buildings in the City of Sydney, Woollahra Municipality, the North Shore and other regional areas are listed on local and state government registers.

The listed buildings of Maurice B. Halligan in the Woollahra Municipality are generally large, sophisticated Arts and Crafts buildings, with outstanding form, detailing or other features that make them aesthetically distinguished and significant.

It is concluded that *Duntrim*, as a minimum, meets the comparative standard for listing, and in several cases, exceeds the criteria for listing when compared to

Halligan's currently listed buildings. It could be compared to *Yeomerry*, although *Duntrim* has a greater landmark quality, scale and garden setting.

Assessment of heritage impact

Note: Council's position on the heritage significance of the subject property has changed due to the following factors: additional research and site visits were carried out following from the recommendations of the previous heritage referral response; and subsequently, the additional research changed the conclusion of the comparative analysis.

Relevant statutory and policy documents

The assessment is made using the following statutory and policy heritage conservation provisions:

Woollahra LEP 1995 Part 1 clause 2(1)(g) and 2(2)(g); Part 4 clause 26; 27 and 28
Woollahra Residential DCP 2003 (WRDCP 2003)
Heritage Act of NSW

- The proposed demolition of the building *Duntrim* and components of its grounds and landscaping would have a high negative impact upon the heritage significance of the place.
- The building should be considered as a 1911 Arts and Crafts building built upon the site and foundations of a former Victorian villa, not as an altered 1852 Victorian villa. The original siting of and the potential archaeology from the 1852 Victorian villa add to the historic significance of the place, and do not detract from the integrity of the Arts and Crafts form of the existing house.
- The building is of substantial scale and in good condition and thus has value as a property asset. Demolition is considered to be an unsustainable development proposal in terms of retaining value, whether cultural heritage or otherwise.
- Should the building no longer be required for its current use, it should be adaptively re-used. The Tanner Statement of Environmental Effects provides several options for re-use of the site and *Duntrim*. These include adaptive re-use of *Duntrim* for residential purposes. This would in principle be supported in heritage conservation terms.
- The significant grounds and landscaping should be retained, as it is a component of the heritage significance of the place.

Conclusion

The application for the demolition of *Duntrim* is not acceptable as it does not comply with all the provisions of the relevant statutory and policy documents as shown in the above assessment and would have a highly unsatisfactory heritage impact.

It is the conclusion of this report that the building known as *Duntrim* is of such a level of significance that it meets several of the criteria for listing, and thus it should be listed as a local heritage item.

Recommendation

Refusal for the following reason: the building known as *Duntrim* meets the threshold for heritage listing under several criteria, and should be listed as a local heritage item.

The building and its grounds should be retained, and the building adaptively re-used.

The nurses' home building and the workshop building do not have the same significance as *Duntrim*, and their demolition is considered acceptable.

The Norfolk Island Pine is to be retained and protected during any future works.

The grounds have significance, and a heritage assessment of the grounds and landscaping should be carried out, to allow inclusion of relevant features in the listing.

Sara Reilly
Strategic Heritage Officer